

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION

|                              |   |                                      |
|------------------------------|---|--------------------------------------|
| SOUTH CAROLINA COASTAL       | ) |                                      |
| CONSERVATION LEAGUE et al.,  | ) |                                      |
|                              | ) |                                      |
| Plaintiffs,                  | ) |                                      |
|                              | ) |                                      |
| v.                           | ) | No. 2:18-cv-03326-RMG                |
|                              | ) | (Consolidated with 2:18-cv-3327-RMG) |
| WILBUR ROSS, IN HIS OFFICIAL | ) |                                      |
| CAPACITY AS THE SECRETARY OF | ) |                                      |
| COMMERCE, et al.,            | ) |                                      |
|                              | ) |                                      |
| Defendants.                  | ) |                                      |
|                              | ) |                                      |

**RESPONSE OF PLAINTIFFS-INTERVENORS STATES OF MARYLAND,  
CONNECTICUT, DELAWARE, MAINE, NEW JERSEY, NEW YORK, AND  
NORTH CAROLINA AND COMMONWEALTHS OF MASSACHUSETTS  
AND VIRGINIA TO FEDERAL DEFENDANTS' STATUS REPORT**

In response to the Status Report (ECF 281) filed by the Federal Defendants in response to the Court's order dated May 2, 2019 (ECF 266), Plaintiffs-Intervenors the States of Maryland, Connecticut, Delaware, Maine, New Jersey, New York, and North Carolina and the Commonwealths of Massachusetts and Virginia ("the States") respectfully state as follows:

1. The Court requested that the Federal Defendants provide a status report regarding "what impact, if any, Secretary Bernhardt's announcement has on this case, including on the pending permit requests." ECF 266. Although that report hedges on the status of the 2019-2024 National Outer Continental Shelf (OCS) Oil and Gas Leasing Program, it makes one thing crystal-clear: the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM) has continued to process permits for the seismic testing activities at issue in this case. ECF 281, at 2 (stating that "the permit applications submitted by Spectrum GEO Inc., TGS-NOPEC Geophysical Company, ION GeoVentures, West-

ernGeco, LLC, and CGG are still under review by BOEM and the Department of Interior”). Accordingly, preliminary injunctive relief remains every bit as necessary as it was prior to the Secretary’s announcement.

2. The Federal Defendants state that the Department of the Interior “is evaluating what, if any, effect” the decision in *League of Conservation Voters v. Trump* “may have on planning for OCS lease sales in the National OCS Oil and Gas Leasing Program.” ECF 281, at 2. They further state that “[t]he Department of Interior is reviewing all its options,” without providing any indication of how long that review will take. *Id.* To the extent that the Department’s review and evaluation result in a delay in the issuance of a Proposed Program for 2019-2024, as recent media reports have indicated, that delay undercuts any argument that it is urgent to conduct seismic testing *now*, and underscores that an injunction would serve the public interest. *See* ECF 148-1, at 6-7.

3. The Federal Defendants assert that “[e]ntities seeking to conduct geological and geophysical surveys can . . . obtain a permit in *any* area of the OCS, including those areas that have been withdrawn from leasing,” ECF 281, at 2 (emphasis in original), and that *League of Conservation Voters v. Trump* “has no legal effect on any proposed seismic activities (in the Atlantic OSC or elsewhere),” *id.* at 1-2. The States reserve the right to respond more fully once they can evaluate these assertions in the concrete setting of any permits that BOEM issues. At an absolute minimum, however, the permanent withdrawal of particular areas from oil and gas leasing necessarily means that seismic testing for oil and gas in those areas would be “*unduly* harmful to aquatic life,” 43 U.S.C. § 1340(a) (emphasis added), and thus barred by statute. *See id.* (allowing Secretary of the Interior to authorize “geological and geophysical explorations” on the OCS only if, among other things, those explorations “are not unduly harmful to aquatic life in such area”); *cf.* ECF 282-3, at

2 (BOEM Director’s January 5, 2017 instruction to deny seismic testing permits “in light of the removal of the Atlantic from consideration for leasing during the next five years”). Because the only purpose of such testing is to explore for oil and gas, *any* harm to aquatic life resulting from testing in withdrawn areas necessarily would be “undue.” In addition, although the statute does contemplate testing in areas that *have not* been leased, *see* 43 U.S.C. § 1340(a)(1)-(2), it does not follow—nor would it be logical to conclude—that BOEM may authorize testing in areas, including those in the Atlantic Ocean, that have been *permanently removed* from leasing. *See League of Conservation Voters v. Trump*, 363 F. Supp. 3d 1013, 1031 & n.97 (D. Alaska 2019) (making clear that specified withdrawals, including the December 2016 withdrawal of certain areas off of the Atlantic coast, “will remain in full force and effect”).

4. In all events, and as explained above, no aspect of the Federal Defendants’ status report diminishes the need for preliminary injunctive relief.

May 17, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

BRIAN E. FROSH  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MARYLAND

Joshua M. Segal (PHV)  
Assistant Attorney General  
John B. Howard, Jr. (PHV)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
200 Saint Paul Place  
Baltimore, MD 21202  
Telephone: (410) 576-6446  
Facsimile: (410) 576-7036  
jsegal@oag.state.md.us  
jbhoward@oag.state.md.us

Emily A. Vainieri (PHV)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
Maryland Department of Natural Resources  
580 Taylor Avenue, C-4  
Annapolis, MD 21401  
Telephone: 410-260-8352  
Facsimile: 410-260-8364  
emily.vainieri1@maryland.gov

*Counsel for the State of Maryland*

/s/ W. Jefferson Leath, Jr.  
W. Jefferson Leath, Jr. (Fed. Bar No. 2627)  
Jefferson Leath, Esq., LLC  
40 Calhoun Street, Suite 400  
Charleston, SC 29401  
Telephone: (843) 853-5353  
jeff@seekingslaw.com

*Counsel for the States of Maryland,  
Connecticut, Delaware, Maine, New Jersey,  
and New York and the Commonwealths of  
Massachusetts and Virginia*

WILLIAM TONG  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CONNECTICUT

Daniel Salton (PHV)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 120, 55 Elm Street  
Hartford, CT 06141-0120  
Telephone: (860) 808-5250  
Facsimile: (860) 808-5387  
daniel.salton@ct.gov

*Counsel for the State of Connecticut*

KATHY JENNINGS  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF DELAWARE

Ilona Kirshon (PHV)  
Deputy State Solicitor  
David J. Lyons (PHV)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Jameson A.L. Tweedie (PHV)  
Deputy Attorney General  
Department of Justice  
Carvel State Building, 6th Floor  
820 North French Street  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Telephone: (302) 577-8372  
Facsimile: (302) 577-6630  
ilona.kirshon@delaware.gov  
david.lyons@delaware.gov  
jameson.tweedie@delaware.gov

*Counsel for the State of Delaware*

AARON FREY  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MAINE

Margaret A. Bensinger (PHV)  
Assistant Attorney General  
6 State House Station  
Augusta, ME 04333-0006  
Telephone: (207) 626-8578  
Facsimile: (207) 626-8812  
peggy.bensinger@maine.gov  
jerry.reid@maine.gov

*Counsel for the State of Maine*

MAURA HEALEY  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF  
MASSACHUSETTS

Matthew Ireland (PHV)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Megan M. Herzog (PHV)  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
Environmental Protection Division  
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor  
Boston, MA 02108  
Telephone: (617) 727-2200  
Facsimile: (617) 727-9665  
matthew.ireland@mass.gov  
megan.herzog@mass.gov

*Counsel for the Commonwealth of  
Massachusetts*

GURBIR S. GREWAL  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW JERSEY

Dianna E. Shinn (PHV)  
Deputy Attorney General  
R.J. Hughes Justice Complex  
25 Market Street  
P.O. Box 093  
Trenton, NJ. 08625-0093  
Telephone: (609) 376-2789  
Facsimile: (609) 341-5030  
dianna.shinn@law.njoag.gov

*Counsel for the State of New Jersey*

JOSHUA H. STEIN  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF  
NORTH CAROLINA

/s/ William Harkins  
William Harkins ((Fed. Bar No. 10334)  
Assistant Attorney General  
Marc Bernstein (PHV)  
Special Deputy Attorney General  
Ryan Park (PHV)  
Deputy Solicitor General  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
PO Box 629  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
Telephone: (919) 716-6535  
Facsimile: (919) 716-6761  
wharkins@ncdoj.gov  
mbernstein@ncdoj.gov  
rpark@ncdoj.gov

*Counsel for the State of North Carolina*

LETITIA JAMES  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW YORK

Andrew G. Frank (PHV)  
Assistant Attorney General  
New York State Attorney General's Office  
28 Liberty Street  
New York, NY. 10005  
Telephone: (212) 416-8271  
Facsimile: (212) 416-6007  
andrew.frank@ag.ny.gov

*Counsel for the State of New York*

MARK R. HERRING  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF VIRGINIA

Paul Kugelman (PHV)  
Senior Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Virginia Attorney General  
202 North 9th Street  
Richmond, VA 23219  
Telephone: (804) 786-3811  
Facsimile: (804) 786-2650  
pkugelman@oag.state.va.us

*Counsel for the Commonwealth of Virginia*